University of Bologna, Italy. Founded in 1088 and the oldest European university in continuous existence. The oldest continuous higher education institution is Al Quaraouiyine University in Fez, Morroco (founded 859 CE)

U U U

A

.

SIDT STREET

HOLLEN BURNS

# Assessing the contributions of higher education

Webinar I of 4: 14 March 2023 Seeing higher education as a state, seeing higher education and society

Brendan Cantwell, Simon Marginson, Daria Platonova and Anna Smolentseva



# Assessing the contributions of higher education: *the book*

- Edward Elgar monograph just released
- Edited by Simon Marginson, Brendan Cantwell, Daria Platonova and Anna Smolentseva
- 12 chapters, 18 authors from 11 different countries/systems
- Available open access, free download, at: https://www.elgaronline.com/edcollbook-og/book/9781035307173/97810353071

https://www.elgaronline.com/edcollbook-oa/book/9781035307173/9781035307173.xml

- Research financed by Higher School of Economics, Moscow (in happier days before the war), and the OA publication financed by contributors/editors
- Chapters are being presented in four CGHE webinars from 14-23 March 2023

EDITED BY Simon Marginson Brendan Cantwell Daria Platonova Anna Smolentseva



ASSESSING THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF HIGHER EDUCATION

Knowledge for a Disordered World



# Assessing the contributions of higher education: chapters 1-7

1919 Elear

NS OF TION

	Chapter	Authors	EDITED BY Simon Marginson Brendan Cantwell Daria Platonova Anna Smolentseva
I	Introduction: Higher education and the contributions problem	Simon Marginson, Brendan Cantwell, Daria Platonova, Anna Smolentseva	ASSESSING THE CONTRIBUTIONS OI HIGHER EDUCATION
2	Intrinsic and extrinsic outcomes of higher education	Simon Marginson, Brendan Cantwell, Daria Platonova, Anna Smolentseva	Knowledge for a Disordered World
3	Contributions of higher education to society – towards a new conceptualization	Anna Smolentseva	
4	Higher education as student self-formation	Simon Marginson	
5	Higher education, science and the climate crisis	Johanna Witte	
6	Opportunities and challenges for open higher education systems in global context	Marijk van der Wende	
7	A comparison of Chinese and Anglo-American ideas about higher education and public good	Simon Marginson and Lili Yang	

## Assessing the contributions of higher education: chapters 8-14

ChapterAuthors8US-China collaboration in science for the global common goodJohn Haupt and Jenny LeeSESSESING THE CONTREDUCIONS CONTREDUCIONS CONTREDUCIÓN CONTREDUCIÓNS CONTREDU				
common goodContributions of James RobsonContributions of Contributions of Ingher education and democracyJames Robson10UNESCO's common good idea of higher education and democracyRita Locatelli and Simon MarginsonImage: Solar of the contribution of Solar of the contributions of higher education through the politics of reformBrendan Cantwell and Daria PlatonovaImage: Solar of the contribution of Solar of the contributions of higher education through the politics of reformGlen JonesImage: Solar of the contribution of Solar of the contributions of higher education12The professoriate and public policyGlen JonesImage: Solar of the contributions of higher education13Cultural contributions of higher education and regional elite formation inAleksei Egorov and Sergey MalinovskiyImage: Solar of the contribution of the contribution of higher education inSolar of the contribution of Solar of the contribution of the contribution of higher education in14Higher education and regional elite formation inAleksei Egorov and Sergey MalinovskiyImage: Solar of the contribution of the contribution of the contribution of the contribution of Solar of the contribution of the contribution of the c		Chapter	Authors	Simon Marginson Brendan Cantwell Elgar
<ul> <li>9 Graduate employment and employability James Robson</li> <li>10 UNESCO's common good idea of higher education and democracy</li> <li>11 Understanding the contributions of higher education education through the politics of reform</li> <li>12 The professoriate and public policy</li> <li>13 Cultural contributions of higher education</li> <li>14 Higher education and regional elite formation in</li> </ul>	8	5	John Haupt and Jenny Lee	CONTRIBUTIONS OF
and democracy11Understanding the contributions of higher education through the politics of reformBrendan Cantwell and Daria Platonova12The professoriate and public policyGlen Jones13Cultural contributions of higher education RomanenkoJussi Valimaa, Terhi Nokhala and Ksenia Romanenko14Higher education and regional elite formation inAleksei Egorov and Sergey Malinovskiy	9	Graduate employment and employability	James Robson	Knowledge for a Disordered World
education through the politics of reformGlen Jones12The professoriate and public policyGlen Jones13Cultural contributions of higher education RomanenkoJussi Valimaa, Terhi Nokhala and Ksenia Romanenko14Higher education and regional elite formation inAleksei Egorov and Sergey Malinovskiy	10	<b>3 3</b>	Rita Locatelli and Simon Marginson	
13 Cultural contributions of higher education       Jussi Valimaa, Terhi Nokhala and Ksenia         14 Higher education and regional elite formation in       Aleksei Egorov and Sergey Malinovskiy	11		Brendan Cantwell and Daria Platonova	
Image: Addition and regional elite formation in       Aleksei Egorov and Sergey Malinovskiy	12	The professoriate and public policy	Glen Jones	
	13	Cultural contributions of higher education	5	
	14	•	Aleksei Egorov and Sergey Malinovskiy	

# Two kinds of purposes of higher education

### Intrinsic purposes

- the education of students
- the transmission, creation and dissemination of knowledge

These purposes are the core of the sector and distinctive to its internal organisation and its social reproduction. Teaching/learning and scholarship/research are grounded in epistemic disciplines, study programmes and schools or departments. They can be fully carried out without the involvement of social partners and can be controlled on an independent basis within higher education

### Extrinsic purposes

There is a long list of purposes manifest through collaborations between higher education and social partners, such as the preparation of students in work, the professions and occupations; their socialisation as law abiding, politically connected and tolerant citizens; the contribution of institutions to building cities and regions, and cross-border relations; the many faculty inputs into government. The extrinsic purpose rest on the intrinsic core capacity of higher education institutions.

# Biesta's (2009) three functions of education

Biesta, Gert (2009). Good education in an age of measurement: On the need to reconnect with the question of purpose in education. Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability, 21: 33–46. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11092-008-9064-9

- Qualification. Providing students/graduates with the knowledge, skills and understanding, and dispositions and forms of judgement, that allow them to 'do something' ranging from the very specific (e.g. training for a particular job or profession, or in a particular skill), to political literacy, to acquiring cultural knowledge that is practised socially. The qualification function is a main reason for funding education and is 'particularly, but not exclusively, connected to economic arguments'
- **Socialisation.** 'The many ways in which, through education, we become members of and part of particular social, cultural and political "orders" ... education is never neutral but always represents something in particular ways.' Both open transmission of norms and values, and 'hidden curricula'
- Subjectification. The 'individuating' effect of education, students becoming self-realising subjects.
   'Any education worthy of its name should always contribute to processes of subjectification that allow those being educated to become more autonomous and independent in their thinking and acting' (Biesta pp. 40-41). Subjectification does not subordinate students to society, and can also be distinguished from objectification (e.g. graduates reified as units of economic value)

## The two purposes and three functions together

<b>Biesta (2009) function</b> (understood as student learning)	Intrinsic purposes: (a) teaching and learning inside higher education; and (b) scholarship and knowledge creation, transmission and dissemination	<b>Extrinsic purposes:</b> Shared between higher education and social partners, e.g. curriculum design and certification in law; applied research for industry
Qualification:	SECONDARY ACTIVITY	PRIMARY ACTIVITY
learning to do things, e.g. in	The intrinsic core foundational	The qualification function is
professions, as active citizens	to the extrinsic purposes	realised in extrinsic purposes
Socialisation:	PRIMARY ACTIVITY	SECONDARY ACTIVITY
ordering of students in terms of	Knowledges and teaching	Relations with social partners
external norms and values	contribute to socialisation	also contribute to socialisation
Subjectification:	PRIMARY ACTIVITY	MINOR ACTIVITY
becoming an autonomous self-	Subjectification is concentrated	Social partners want regulated
realising person	in education and knowledge	not self-determining autonomy

# The two purposes and three functions together 2

<b>Biesta function</b> (understood as student learning)	Intrinsic purposes: (a) teaching and learning inside higher education; and (b) scholarship and knowledge creation, transmission and dissemination	<b>Extrinsic purposes:</b> Shared between higher education and social partners, e.g. curriculum design and certification in law; applied research for industry
Qualification:	SECONDARY ACTIVITY	PRIMARY ACTIVITY
learning to do things, e.g. in	The intrinsic core foundational	The qualification function is
professions, as active citizens	to the extrinsic purposes	realised in extrinsic purposes
Socialisation:	PRIMARY ACTIVITY	SECONDARY ACTIVITY
ordering of students in terms of	Knowledges and teaching	Relations with social partners
external norms and values	contribute to socialisation	also contribute to socialisation
Subjectification:	PRIMARY ACTIVITY	MINOR ACTIVITY
becoming an autonomous self-	Subjectification is concentrated	Social partners want regulated
realising person	in education and knowledge	not self-determining autonomy

# The two purposes and three functions together 3

<b>Biesta function</b> (understood as student learning)	Intrinsic purposes: (a) teaching and learning inside higher education; and (b) scholarship and knowledge creation, transmission and dissemination	<b>Extrinsic purposes:</b> Shared between higher education and social partners, e.g. curriculum design and certification in law; applied research for industry
Qualification:	SECONDARY ACTIVITY	PRIMARY ACTIVITY
learning to do things, e.g. in	The intrinsic core foundational	The qualification function is
professions, as active citizens	to the extrinsic purposes	realised in extrinsic purposes
Socialisation:	PRIMARY ACTIVITY	SECONDARY ACTIVITY
ordering of students in terms of	Knowledges and teaching	Relations with social partners
external norms and values	contribute to socialisation	also contribute to socialisation
Subjectification:	PRIMARY ACTIVITY	MINOR ACTIVITY
becoming an autonomous self-	Subjectification is concentrated	Social partners want regulated
realising person	in education and knowledge	not self-determining autonomy

## Contributions of higher education are individualised and collective national and global

#### national

If you would like to share your thoughts on the topic of this webinar on social media, use the hashtag #AssessingHE so we can easily find your posts

#### individualised

I Individualised national goods

Greater agency freedom

Better social position

Augmented earnings and employment rates

Lifetime health and financial outcomes, etc

3 Collective national goods Ongoing development of professions/occupations Shared social literacy, opportunity structure Inputs to government Stronger regions, cities 2 Individualised global goods Cross-border mobility and employability Communications facility

Knowledge of diverse languages and cultures

Access to global science

global

4 Collective global goods Universal global science Diverse knowledge fields Common zone of free critical inquiry Systems for exchange, collaboration, mobility

collective