

## Effort or Pedigree

Elite Reproduction in the Chinese Higher Education System

> LIANG Zhitang, YANG Po Peking University July 19<sup>th</sup>, 2022



# Introduction

1%

## Introduction

**Research Context & Research Questions** 

#### Context

Expansion of global higher education and consequences: social congestion (Breen, 2010)

Employment inequality among elite unviersity graduates: Internal: differences in organizations & positions External: differences on industries

Elite reproduction in the US and social circles (Rivera, 2015; Abraham, 2019)



## Research

### Questions

1. During the process of elite reproduction, how do members of elite education circles gain entry into elite job circles?

2. With regard to the transition from elite education circles to the elite job circles, what are the factors causing graduates to have unequal career choices?

3. What is the mechanism behind different career outcomes?

# **Literature Review**

#### Review

Education and social inequality: positional conflict theory

Credential inflation & opportunity inequality

Main strategies in positional competitions: Ranking: utilization of advantages Rigging: affect rules and environment

Accumulation of positional advantages based on pedigree

Elite Elite Social Class Elite Elite Elite Enployment

1 2

Comments

Social class and university graduates' internships and employment

Social-cognitive career theory: model for development of career interest and career choice



#### **Research questions**

During the process of elite reproduction, how do members of elite education circles gain entry into elite job circles in China?

With regard to the transition from the elite education circles to the elite job circles, what are the factors leading to unequal career choices?

What are the strategies for elite reproduction through higher education?



## Methods & Findings



#### Methodology

Methods: explanatory embedded multiple-case study

Data analysis: transcript, MAX QDA 2022, 'thick description'(Geertz, 1973)

Typical case sampling, 6 interviewees, semi-structural interviews, validity

Validity: research design, analysis, coding

#### Interviewees

	and the second				
Name	Gender	Major	Employment Location	Employment Field	Employment Position
Ana	F	Economics	National	Government	Civil servant (International cooperation)
Beatriz	F	Literature	International	Internet company	Product manager
Ci	F	Economics	National	Consulting	Business analyst
Dylan	М	Politics	Local	Private company	Sales (energy)
Elio	М	Economics	Local	Internet company	Strategy
Fred	М	Law	Local	Law firm	Lawyer
a subscription of the	and the second	a production		CONTRACTOR OF THE OWNER.	and the second se



#### **Theoretical Framework**



**Elite reproduction process and strategies** 

Process

Entry Watershed Reserve Absorption Difference Battle

Positioning

Ranking

**Leaping forward** 

Strategies



#### Six stages of the elite reproduction process





#### **Three elite reproduction strategies**

Positioning

A process of career exploration. It relies on career interests in corresponding industries. Individuals establish their career interests, compare internship opportunities, and try to **identify the positional advantages** needed for the said opportunities, which is not entirely consistent with the 'rigging' competition notion proposed by Brown (2013).

Ranking

It is related to mobilising **resources in elite education and internship circles** to identify career paths and accelerate self development, not focusing on mobilizing resources related to their class.

Leaping forward It focuses on the capture of positional advantages, including the **building up of own class status** and the accomplishment of own career choices.

#### **Elite reproduction process and strategies**

#### POSITIONING

Entry: participate in positional competition Pedigree — age consciousness elite consciousness

Confirm qualification

Watershed: differentiated choices Competitions in and out of class

Target positioning regarding to current ranking Reserve: course — club — internship Amulet (knowledge, activity, experience)

Decide track, from positioning to ranking

\*Circulate in elite job circles

Battle: opportunities and choices Local optimum, career interest, realistic conditions

From ranking to leaping forward, position substituted

> LEAPING FORWARD

Difference: personal, family and institutional factors Career re-planning, pass mark ( determined

Ranking changed and finalized

Absorption: opportunity stacking, advantage gap

Gradually into ranking championship

RANKING



### Conclusions

The competitive context and family backgrounds awaken one's elite consciousness, which comes from class confidence and a sense of entitlement, among children from advantaged families in China.

Entry into elite job circles necessitates the application of elite strategies connecting elite education cycle and elite job cycle in China.

As a new source of positional advantages, internships connect elite education and job circles, becoming the crucial step for achieving elite status after college graduation.



### Global and national possible selves: Differentiated strategies for positional competition among Chinese university students

Dr. Benjamin Mulvey, RGC Post-doc Fellow, EdUHK

Dr. Ewan Wright, Assistant Professor, EdUHK



# Context: Neijuan and Chinese higher education

- The paper provides a reading of the term 内卷 *neijuan* (in English' involution') through positional conflict theory.
- Chinese characters for 'inward' and 'rolling', denoting something spiralling inwards, trapping those involved.
- Aim to understand how aspirations in the context of an 'involuted' labour market varied along lines of social class.





# Persistent inequalities after China's higher education expansion

- Gross tertiary enrolment rate increased from ~8 percent in the year 2000 to ~54 percent in 2019 (World Bank, 2021).
- But growth of participation rates has been concentrated among groups associated with high social status (Li, 2015; Ou & Hou, 2019)
- Social inequalities in higher education are also reproduced beyond the point of access through for example internships and student societies (Niu et al., 2009; Pinto et al., 2021)

### **Possible Selves**

- Ability to gain positional advantage and secure prestigious positions in the graduate labour market not only a function of one's ability to draw on socially classed resources but also of both the nature and clarity of one's vision concerning this possible outcome.
- Key concepts:
  - Possible selves i.e. current perceptions about a range of probable life trajectories resulting from constructions of numerous imaginaries (Markus & Nurius, 1986; Harrison, 2018; Henderson et al., 2019).
  - Probable, ideal, and feared selves (Markus & Nurius, 1986)
  - Elaboration (Oyserman et al., 2004)

## Methodology

6

- Two phase qualitative dominant mixed methods design
- 100 semi structured interviews at two universities in Guangdong
  - One elite
  - One less 'prestigious'
- Divide into three social class groups based on rural/urban *Hukou* and proxy measures of SES:
  - Rural
  - Urban non-elite
  - Elite

# Anxiety about the labour market regardless of level of social privilege

'If you don't get a job after you graduate, you have to be supported by your family. Everyone will know that you are a burden on your parents, both financially and emotionally. They will worry about your career and your future' (Rural, Politics).

7

'I worry every night. I feel very nervous about my future...If I don't have a high salary, then I can't buy a house, and I cannot start a family. I don't want my father and mother to have to support me. I think they should enjoy their life after they retire' (Urban elite, History).

# Rural youth: Credential focused and nationally-orientated

'For students from rural areas or small towns, we tend to lack confidence. We have to spend 15 years on schoolwork only, but other students are good at playing piano, playing sports, and organising large activities... They will be more popular among the other students and even among the teachers. It's a kind of culture shock... they seem better than you, and they seem more qualified to be a successful person in society' (Rural, Sociology).

### Urban non-elite: Gaining nationallybound currency in the economy of experience

'I sent a lot of resumes. I hadn't done an internship, so they didn't think I could do the job, so they refused me. They didn't even give me the chance to do an interview. I just kept trying. I applied for more than 70 internships. I felt very down at the moment. But luckily, one company gave me a chance' (Urban non-elite, Language & Literature).

# Urban elite: Envisaging and realising globally orientated possible selves

'I want to go to university in Canada after my studies in [Provincial University]... last summer vacation I went to the visiting summer programme at University of British Columbia. I stayed there for one month. I learnt a lot of things... I wanted to experience life in Canada, as I want to study there after my graduation' (Urban elite, History).

## Discussion

- Findings highlight stark difference between the aspirations/positional competition strategies of graduates from across the socio-economic spectrum
  - Fear of failure and 'emotional burden' (due to familial pressure in Chinese culture?
  - Differences both the **nature** and **clarity** of ideal possible selves
  - Globally- vs. Nationally-oriented
  - Conditioned vs. True (Oyserman et al., 2004)
- Indicates importance of **the scope of individual aspirations** in shaping actions related to positional competition