

Centre for Global Higher Education Working Paper series

LATAM Quality Assurance and Internationalisation: Affordances of a Multidimensional Matrix of (Self) Assessment of Internationalisation of Higher Education

Kyria Rebeca Finardi and Gabriel Brito Amorim

Working paper no. 99 August 2023





Published by the Centre for Global Higher Education,
Department of Education, University of Oxford
15 Norham Gardens, Oxford, OX2 6PY
www.researchcghe.org

© the author 2023

ISSN 2398-564X

The Centre for Global Higher Education (CGHE) is an international research centre focused on higher education and its future development. Our research aims to inform and improve higher education policy and practice.

CGHE is a research partnership of 10 UK and international universities, funded by the Economic and Social Research Council, with support from Research England.

LATAM Quality Assurance and Internationalisation: Affordances of a Multidimensional Matrix of (Self) Assessment of Internationalisation of Higher Education

Kyria Rebeca Finardi and Gabriel Brito Amorim

Contents

Introduction	6
Amorim's (2020) matrix in the making	. 11
The matrix reloaded for other LATAM contexts	. 13
Final Remarks	. 17
References	. 18

LATAM Quality Assurance and Internationalisation: Affordances of a Multidimensional Matrix of (Self) Assessment of Internationalisation of Higher Education

Kyria Rebeca Finardi and Gabriel Brito Amorim

Kyria Finardi is associate professor and a researcher in the Federal University of Espirito Santo (UFES) in Vitoria, Brazil, where she is also a member of the Internationalization Board having created and coordinated the Language Division of the International Office for a decade. Former President of the Brazilian Association of Applied Linguistics https://alab.org.br/diretorias-anteriores, she is the co-founder and co-coordinator of the Ibero-America Association of Applied Linguistics https://aila.info/about/regionalization/aila-ibero-america/ and vice-president of the International Association of Applied Linguistics https://aila.info/about/organization/executive_board/. She has an extensive list of publications (+200) having been cited by almost 2000 people according to information on Google Scholar.

Gabriel Brito Amorim holds a PhD in Linguistics from the Federal University of Espírito Santo (UFES). His PhD research received the 2021 Outstanding Doctoral Research Award from HETL and Emerald Publishing. He is a lecturer in the Department of Foreign Languages and Literatures at the Federal University of Goiás (UFG). His research interests are: internationalization, teacher education, technology and assessment.

Abstract

Given the consensus among academics and policy-makers about the potential of internationalisation of higher education and quality assurance systems to contribute to the modernisation of higher education, on the one hand, and the lack of studies linking quality assurance systems and internationalisation of higher education in Latin America on the other, this study aims to contribute to this gap by presenting a proposal for a matrix of (self) assessment of the internationalisation process of higher education institutions in Latin America. The matrix presented here was produced by Amorim (2020) for the Brazilian context comprising 86 indicators distributed in the three pillars of the university. namely, in the Dimensions of - Teaching, Research and Outreach - analyzed in relation to the Categories - Language Policy, Academic Mobility and Internationalisation at Home suggesting three possibilities for institutional Classification - Internationalised, Engaged and Emerging. An adapted version of Amorim's (2020) matrix is presented in this working paper, comprising 93 indicators that include intra-region and extra-region dimensions/collaborations. The results of the analysis of the matrix suggest that it represents a relevant contribution in the form of a unified instrument for the (self) assessment and management of internationalisation of higher education institutions in the region.

Keywords: Internationalisation, Assessment, (Self) Assessment Matrix

Acknowledgment: This Working Paper is being published by the ESRC/RE Centre for Global Higher Education, funded by the U.K. Economic and Social Research Council (award numbers ES/M010082/1, ES/M010082/2 and ES/T014768/1). The authors would like to thank Brazilian research agencies Fapes and Cnpq for support in the form of Universal and Productivity grants.

Introduction

Changes brought about by globalisation with its agent in higher education – internationalisation – and more recently, by the pandemic and the digital revolution (e.g. Finardi & Guimarães, 2020; Guimarães, Finardi & Amorim, 2021) have altered the higher education landscape. In an article published in the middle of the pandemic¹, Altbach and Salmi (2021) claim that Latin America (LATAM) needs more world-class (top-quality) universities. According to the aforementioned authors, LATAM is the continent with the fewest top quality universities with no university found in the top 100 of global university rankings and relatively few LATAM scholars and scientists among the most highly cited academics, something that was also confirmed by the two studies carried out by Finardi, França and Guimarães (2022, 2023) in regards to the visibility of LATAM scholars and academic productions.

Considering that LATAM represents 8.5% of the world population and produces 8.7% of the planet's GDP, it is hard to understand why Latin American universities account for only 1.6% of the top 500 institutions in the Shanghai ranking and less than 1.5% of the top 400 in the Times Higher Education world university ranking. This is a serious deficiency if LATAM wants to produce quality education and research which is internationally recognized.

Echeverria-King et al. (2023), in a recent analysis of public policies for internationalisation in Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, and Peru, conducted in the context of the Latin American Initiative for the Internationalization of Higher Education (INILAT) conclude that LATAM still suffers from the absence of national policies for the internationalisation of higher education; 2) the predominance of a passive, or "outward", perspective on internationalisation; 3) the concentration of internationalisation strategies in institutions with greater research capacity; 4) a growing emphasis on internationalisation initiatives at home and virtual exchange; and 5) the incipient interest in models of internationalisation "for all" that are more inclusive.

¹ https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20210301134018781, Access on February 23rd, 2023.

Because of that, some researchers (e.g. Finardi, 2022; Leal, Finardi & Abba, 2022) have been arguing for a situated model of internationalisation for and from the Global South. More specifically and in what concerns LATAM, these authors claim that the process of internationalisation of higher education (IHE) must acknowledge that together with the opportunities afforded by this process, there are several issues that are contradictory, contestable, ethical and complex that reinforce power asymmetries and hierarchies. Because of that, these authors suggest that IHE in LATAM must be positioned within the historical and geopolitical global system where it is almost invisible.

One reason for this "invisibility" of LATAM universities in the IHE and "global conversations" may be linked to the lack of evaluation controls and quality assurance systems and/or their heterogeneous applications throughout the region. One common denominator among the region's universities seems to be the almost total absence of a strategic vision for the higher education sector. Quality assurance in the last 2 or 3 decades has contributed relatively little to solving the structural problems of the sector and the challenges facing the evolution of higher education in the region as evidenced by its minimal competitive participation at the global level.

According to Carlos Olivares (2023) in another recent article², LATAM and the Caribbean today represent 8.2% of the world's population, with a total of 662 million people. According to projections, the area will reach its maximum population in 2056, with 752 million people. By 2100, projections indicate that the percentage of the population aged 60 and over in the region will be higher than in Asia, North America, Oceania and Africa. In April 2023, the International Monetary Fund indicated that the region would account for 5.26% of the world's GDP.

Moreover, only 10 universities in the region are among the top 500 institutions worldwide in the Shanghai university ranking and only 2.25% are in the Times Higher Education World University Ranking's top 400. The population between 18 and 24 years of age enrolled in the region's higher education institutions is approximately 4.6%. This figure represents an enormous challenge. Therefore,

https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=2023012714330595&utm_source=new sletter&utm_medium=email&utm_campaign=GLNL0724, Access on February 27th, 2023.

²

higher education institutions must ensure the quality of their teaching, research, innovation, as well as community and international engagement.

To this end, Carlos Olivares suggests the use of strategic management models applying business intelligence and advanced analytics systems for proactive decision-making and practical approaches for comprehensive quality assurance. Unfortunately, however, many higher education institutions in the region continue to apply governance models that respond to other times and realities and that suffer from fragile institutional management and lack of professionalization once most state institutions are run by academics with no professional training in management.

Institutions dedicated to higher education quality assurance in LATAM are very heterogeneous and concentrate on the accreditation of undergraduate, graduate and on-site institutional careers.

In some cases, such as the Brazilian³ and most notably the Colombian National Accreditation Systems, it is evident that the direct and indirect participation of the government has led to changes in administration and bureaucratization slowing down the necessary procedures for self-evaluation and external evaluation processes.

This in turn has stemmed doubts about the actual value of their higher education systems in the eyes of society. In the case of Brazil, during the Bolsonaro administration (2018-2022), science and the higher education system were under constant attack of the government on the grounds that the investments made in science and higher education (by the federal government⁴) did not translate into quality assurance or benefits to society.

A similar panorama can be seen in other countries in LATAM where various factors are involved in the quality assurance systems. In the case of Chile, for example, beyond the procedures established in the 2018 higher education law, the National Accreditation Commission (CNA) operates in a complex environment when it comes to proactive decision-making. Moreover, when it

⁴ The Brazilian educational system is funded by the federal government (higher education), state government (secondary education) and city government (primary education).

³ Capes is responsible for the evaluation of graduate programs in Brazil but during the Bolsonaro's administration (2019-2022), it suffered severe cuts and interventions.

comes to the process of internationalization of higher education, there are still strong colonial footprints in the academic mobility programs in Chile and Brazil, as shown in Chiappa and Finardi (2021) and an orientation towards more competition than collaboration in the Latin American internationalisation process (Finardi, Mendes & Silva, 2022).

Moreover, the different approaches and beliefs held about public versus private institutions in the region influence decision-making, quality assurance, accreditation and the perception of society in terms of the value of higher education. For example, the belief that private institutions are "commercial" whereas public ones offer quality education has to be taken with caution despite the many cases that support this belief. In Brazil, for example, though public universities represent only about 12% of the total, they are responsible for more than 90% of all the research produced in the country since private institutions focus mainly on teaching and the delivery of undergraduate degrees (Amorim & Finardi, 2022).

Notwithstanding the role of public universities in Brazil as seen in its 12 public universities (USP, Unicamp, UFRJ, Unesp, UFMG, UFRGS, UFSC, UNB, Unifesp, UFSCAR, UFPR, UFPE) ranked among the 50 best in LATAM⁵ with only one private university (PUC-Rio de Janeiro) in the list of 50 top, many of the other LATAM universities ranked top are private. As a consequence of the pandemic, a series of public and private higher education institutions have received institutional accreditation in the region without reference to the many doubts regarding institutional effectiveness in aspects such as innovations in terms of curricula and pedagogies especially after the pandemic (e.g. Guimarães, Hildeblando Junior & Finardi, 2022; Guimarães & Finardi, 2023).

In addition, it is disappointing that self-evaluation reports often comprise enormous, descriptive and self-referential documents lacking overall accountability to society or analysis and strategic planning. In other countries in Central America, the national quality assurance bodies suffer from state interference in decision-making regarding quality, favouring formal compliance

9

_

⁵ https://www.topuniversities.com/university-rankings/latin-american-university-rankings/2023, Accessed on February 27th, 2023.

over improvement. This scenario inhibits higher education institutional innovation and internationalisation.

Government regulation exercised through accreditation processes oriented more towards compliance reinforces the standardisation of content, forcing many higher education institutions to deliver comparable/similar degree programmes that do not address local lifelong learning demands, particularly on a continent that anticipates having one of the largest populations of over-60-year-olds in the next decade. Nor does it address the substantial change in the provision of skills and knowledge that is happening as a result of the microcredentialing ⁶ offered by multiple companies via the internet in the post-pandemic scenario.

Given the scenario laid out above, there is still a long way for quality assurance systems in higher education institutions in LATAM to induce internationalisation and innovation ensuring effective organisational diversity rather than mere bureaucratic compliance. One way to analyze this trend is to contrast the information on LATAM higher education institutions accredited as of the highest quality by their national systems with their position in the most prestigious international rankings. Notwithstanding the caveats of using rankings for analyses (e.g. Finardi & Guimarães, 2017) on the account that these rankings fail to capture the singularities of each context and are biased due to the value given to research, development and innovation, the rapid advance of data analytics means these rankings will adapt their variables and may offer significant competition to quality assurance agencies, commissions and councils. Moreover, since their results are much simpler and available to read, they may have more impact on the general population and society at large.

Considering the link between internationalisation of higher education and quality assurance (e.g. Finardi, Moore & Guimarães, 2021), coupled with the need to evaluate these dimensions in LATAM, this study aims to contribute to this gap by presenting a proposal for a matrix of (self) assessment of the internationalisation process of higher education institutions in Latin America. Thus, without further due, we present the matrix produced by Amorim (2020)

⁶ https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20220705223949571, Accessed on February 27th, 2023.

and reported in Amorim and Finardi (2021, 2022) for Brazil, adapted for the context of Latin America.

Amorim's (2020) matrix in the making

The process of internationalisation of higher education (IHE) in Brazil is still considered passive (Lima & Maranhão, 2009), sending more students than receiving international students, disarticulated (Ramos, 2018) since the three dimensions of the university, namely, teaching, research and outreach are not contemplated equally in that process, and because of that, the process of IHE is also considered incipient. Motivated by the need to evaluate this process in Brazil, Amorim (2020) built an instrument to guide the self-evaluation and planning of the IHE in Brazil whose matrix is adapted here for the context of Latin America.

Amorim's (2020) matrix was built considering models put forth by other scholars in the field and also by accredited agencies like the Brazilian Association for International Education (FAUBAI) and other evaluation system such as the one used by the Coordination of Advancement of Higher Education Personnel (CAPES). After the scrutiny of the literature, Amorim (2020)'s matrix was proposed comprising 86 indicators which encompass: 1) three dimensions, namely, teaching, research and outreach; 2) 3 categories of analysis, namely, language policy, academic mobility and internationalisation at home and, 3) and three suggested classifications for the institution, that is, internationalised, engaged and emerging.

Table 1: Dimensions, Categories e Classifications of Amorim's 2020 Matrix

Dimension	Categories	Classifications
Teaching	Language Policy	Internationalised
Research	Academic Mobility	Engaged
Outreach	Internationalisation at Home	Emerging

Source: Adapted from Amorim (2020)

Amorim's (2020) instrument was inspired by a previous study (Amorim & Finardi, 2017) that analysed the IHE process in a public university in Brazil in three dimensions: the macro dimension (government-funded programs and policies), meso (institutional policies and programmes) and micro (perceptions of the

academic community). Results of Amorim and Finardi (2017) suggest that these three levels were disarticulated rendering the process IHE in that institution incipient and lacking self-evaluation. Thus, so as to contribute to the process of sefl-evaluation strategic planning, accountability and quality assurance Brazilian universities, Amorim's (2020) matrix was designed and piloted/calibrated in the same institution where the previous study (Amorim & Finardi, 2017) had been carried out. A few years later, and as can be seen in the introduction to this paper, we feel that it is high time that Amorim's matrix is adapted for the Latin American context too.

Documents such as the FAUBAl's Orientations for Language Policies for Higher Education and the EMI Guides 2016 and 2018 and also evaluation criteria used by CAPES informed the matrix then proposed by organizing the indicators in form of questions and the classifications according to the ranks established by CAPES. Veidemane and Kaiser (2023) address the current and urgent need for designing indicators that aim at sustainable education. The Times Higher Education Impact Rankings, for example, focus on the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) by emphasizing research, education and community outreach. Bearing that in mind, the proposal for the adaptation of Amorim's (2020) matrix designed for the Brazilian context shall promote sustainability as a key component when redesigning their indicators.

Table 2: Summary of Suggested Institutional Classifications Proposed by the Matrix

Classifications	CAPES's Grade	Percentage (≅)	Points ("yes")
Internationalised	Grade 5	85% –100%	70 – 86
Engaged	Grade 4	60% - 84%	50 – 69
Emerging	Grade 3	Less than 60%	Less than de 50

Source: Amorim (2020)

Techniques of the development methodology (Van den Akker, 1999) were used in the matrix motivated by the need to make practical interventions with the analyses of the matrix which was theoretically embedded. The matrix represents a unified assessment, instrument (Coomble, Folse & Hubley, 2007) whose contributions are: 1) utility – the instrument is useful for stakeholders for strategic planning; 2) validity – the matrix is foregrounded in the literature and documents of the field; 3) reliability – the matrix can be used to verify the consistency of results; 4) practicality – the matrix can be digitalized allowing

online evaluation of data also compiled digitally; 5) washback effects on directions – the (self) reflection process can direct strategic planning; 6) authenticity – it represents a solution or an intervention for a real problem; 7) transparency/accountability – results can be made available for stakeholders and community at large; and 8) security – regarding the institutional agents and data involved in the evaluation process.

All things considered, Amorim's (2020) matrix provides meaningful input and orientations for Brazilian HEI that wish to internationalise in a more strategically planned, comprehensive, critical, sustainable and articulated manner. In the following section, an adaption of this matrix for other LATAM contexts will be presented.

The matrix reloaded for other LATAM contexts

As Amorim's (2020) instrument was developed specifically for the Brazilian context, a bit of revision is in order for adapting the document to other Latin American contexts. Because the documents that guided the conception of the first matrix came from Brazilian organizations and the indicators were then built considering those plus other scholarly works, the first adaptation regards the number of indicators. In the adapted version of the matrix, there are 93 indicators (as opposed to 86 from the original), maintaining the same dimensions, categories of analysis and suggested classifications.

As stated previously, the reloaded matrix shall focus and emphasize sustainability across its 93 indicators, 3 dimensions and 3 categories of analysis. More emphasis is put on the "Internationalisation at Home" category as way for institutions to look within their structure and strategically plan their internationalisation actions. As follows, the adapted matrix is presented:

Table 3: Category: Language Policy

#	Indicator	Yes	No	Don't Know
	The LIFE has an approved institutional language notice that includes the three nillars			KIIOW
1	The HEI has an approved institutional language policy that includes the three pillars			
	of the university (teaching, research and outreach).			
2	The role of foreign languages in the three pillars of the university (teaching, research			
	and outreach) is well defined in the HEI's internationalisation plan.			
3	The HEI adopts different languages for admission purposes.			
4	The HEI adopts different languages for teaching purposes.			
5	The HEI adopts different languages for instruction purposes.			
6	The HEI adopts different languages for research purposes.			
7	The HEI adopts different languages for communication purposes.			

8	The HEI has specific guidelines for each dimension of language use (admission,	
	teaching, instruction, research and communication) in its institutional language policy	
	document.	
9	The HEI, through its institutional language policy, promotes the plurality of languages	
	on the IES campuses.	
10	The proficiency test(s), as well as the scores required for admission to both	
	undergraduate and graduate of the HEI, is/are described in the HEI's language policy	
	and is/are endorsed by international academic community, dialogue(s) with other	
	internationally known exams and has/have standardized scores across the HEI.	
11	The HEI has course(s) in Letters.	
11.1	The HEI has a course(s) in Letters with a double degree.	
11.2	The HEI has a course in Letters with a single degree.	
11.3	The Department of Letters at the HEI offers elective and optional disciplines in foreign	
	languages for other courses/majors.	
12	The HEI offers foreign language courses to its staff via its personal development/	
	human resources department.	
12.1	The HEI encourages its professors (through training courses and/or counting points	
	for progression, etc.) to participate in foreign language courses offered either by the	
	HEI or outside of it.	
12.2	The HEI encourages its technical-administrative staff (through training courses and/or	
	counting points for progression, etc.) to participate in foreign language courses	
	offered either by the IES or outside of it.	
12.3	The HEI offers training courses for its managers and employees to deal with foreign	
	documents in different foreign languages.	
13	The HEI has a Nucleus/Center/Extracurricular Language Course for the academic	
40.4	community.	
13.1	Different foreign language courses are offered at the HEI language center for the	
13.2	academic and external community. Scholarships are distributed both to the academic community and to the external	
13.2	community to study foreign languages at the HEI Nucleus/Center/Language Course.	
14	The HEI encourages and prepares its professors to offer specific disciplines at	
	undergraduate and graduate levels in various areas in foreign languages periodically	
	through training courses, functional progression, etc.	
15	Periodically, extension and research actions are offered in foreign languages for the	
	entire academic community.	
16	The HEI encourages its students to participate in specific subjects in foreign	
	languages at the undergraduate level through complementary hours, elective/optional	
	subjects, etc.	
17	The HEI encourages its students to participate in specific disciplines in foreign	
	languages at the graduate level through complementary hours, elective/optional	
	disciplines, etc.	
18	The HEI has a sector responsible for receiving and forwarding documents in foreign	
	languages.	
19	The HEI has trained employees or services to translate official documents into foreign	
	languages.	

languages.
Source: The authors'.

Table 4: Category: Academic Mobility

#	Indicator	Yes	No	Don't
				Know
1	The HEI has a centralized mobility in and out coordination capable of guiding the			
	flow of students entering, staying and leaving the HEI.			
2	The HEI has a mobility program(s) with and without scholarships for its			
	undergraduate students.			
3	The HEI has a mobility program(s) with and without scholarships for its graduate			
	students.			
4	The HEI has a mobility program(s) with and without grants or other forms of			
	financial assistance for its professors.			
5	The HEI has a mobility program(s) with and without grants or other forms of			
	financial assistance for its technical-administrative staff.			
6	There is a balance between programs and number of students in mobility type in			
	and mobility type out in the HEI.			
7	The HEI has intra-regional partnerships for its mobility programs.			
8	The HEI has extra-regional partnerships for its mobility programs.			

9 The HEI offers subjects in the country's official language(s) to its foreigners in the curriculum and as extension and research actions. 10 The HEI encourages academic collaboration (virtual or not) amongst professors, students and employees with other universities in the world. 11 The HEI has a plan to attract students, professors, researchers and foreign employees in various areas. 11.1 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.2 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through training courses, learning workshops, etc.			
10 The HEI encourages academic collaboration (virtual or not) amongst professors, students and employees with other universities in the world. 11 The HEI has a plan to attract students, professors, researchers and foreign employees in various areas. 11.1 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.2 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	9	The HEI offers subjects in the country's official language(s) to its foreigners in the	
students and employees with other universities in the world. 11 The HEI has a plan to attract students, professors, researchers and foreign employees in various areas. 11.1 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.2 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through		curriculum and as extension and research actions.	
11. The HEI has a plan to attract students, professors, researchers and foreign employees in various areas. 11.1 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.2 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	10	The HEI encourages academic collaboration (virtual or not) amongst professors,	
employees in various areas. 11.1 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.2 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through		students and employees with other universities in the world.	
11.1 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.2 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11	The HEI has a plan to attract students, professors, researchers and foreign	
11.2 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through		employees in various areas.	
11.2 The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.1	The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the undergraduate	
11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through		level.	
11.3 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.2	The HEI has professors from intra-regional countries working at the post-graduate	
level. 11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through		level.	
11.4 The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.3	The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the undergraduate	
level. 11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through		10.00	
11.5 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.4	The HEI has professors from extra-regional countries working at the post-graduate	
level. 11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through		level.	
11.6 The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.5	The HEI has students from intra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate	
level. 11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through			
11.7 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the undergraduate level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.6		
level. 11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through			
11.8 The HEI has students from extra-regional countries studying at the post-graduate level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.7	, ,	
level. 11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through			
11.9 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.8		
intra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through			
11.10 The HEI has foreign servants of the technical-administrative staff coming from extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.9	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
extra-regional countries in its various sectors periodically. 12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through			
12 The HEI trains its community and managers for mobility (in and out types) through	11.10		
training courses, learning workshops, etc.	12		
		training courses, learning workshops, etc.	

Source: The authors'.

Table 5: Category: Internationalisation at Home

#	Indicator	Yes	No	Don't Know
1	The HEI has an internationalisation plan documented/approved by the superior council.			1
1.1	The HEI's internationalisation plan makes reference to the three pillars of the university: teaching, research and outreach.			
1.2	The HEI's internationalisation plan refers to actions with HEIs from intra-regional countries.			
1.3	The HEI's internationalisation plan refers to actions with HEIs from extra-regional countries.			
1.4	The HEI's internationalisation plan refers to actions that encompass the local reality of the HEI.			
1.5	The HEI has different motivations to internationalise and these are well outlined in its internationalization plan.			
1.6	The HEI's internationalisation actions are aimed at undergraduate professors.			
1.7	The HEI's internationalisation actions are aimed at post-graduate professors.			
1.8	The HEI's internationalisation actions are aimed at undergraduate students.			
1.9	The HEI's internationalisation actions are aimed at post-graduate students.			
1.10	The HEI's internationalisation actions are aimed at technical-administrative servants at different levels.			
1.11	The HEI's internationalisation plan refers to managers at all levels and pillars of the university (teaching, research and outreach).			
1.12	The HEI has an international relations sector.			
1.13	The HEI's internationalisation plan refers to mobility actions covering the three			
	pillars of the university (teaching, research and outreach) and for undergraduate degrees.			
1.14	The HEI's internationalisation plan refers to mobility actions covering the three			
	pillars of the university (teaching, research and outreach) and for post-graduate			
	degrees.			
1.15	The HEI's internationalisation plan refers to internationalisation actions at home,			
	contemplating the three pillars of the university (teaching, research and outreach).			
2	The HEI has a comprehensive welcome program for its foreign visitors.			

2.1	The HEI has signs and important notices in foreign languages to welcome/inform	
	foreign visitors.	
2.2	The HEI develops activities to integrate foreigners on campus/campuses.	
2.3	The HEI makes laboratories, libraries (physical and digital) and other resources available to foreign academics.	
2.4	The HEI provides free psychological care for its foreign visitors.	
2.5	The HEI provides free educational assistance to its foreign visitors.	
2.6	The HEI provides free health assistance to its foreign visitors.	
2.7	The HEI offers a free meal program at the university restaurant or another low-cost	
	one for its foreign visitors.	
2.8	The HEI has a structure or program to support accommodation for its foreign visitors.	
2.9	The HEI has a structure or program to help transport its foreign visitors to/from the	
	campus/campuses	
2.10	The HEI has an information manual/guide for foreign visitors.	
3	The global-local relationship is taken into account in the formulation of the HEI's	
	undergraduate curricula.	
3.1	Undergraduate curricula are designed/formulated in such a way as to encourage intercultural collaboration (virtual or otherwise) between intra-regional universities.	
3.2	Undergraduate curricula are designed/formulated in such a way as to encourage	
3.2	intercultural collaboration (virtual or otherwise) between extra-regional universities.	
3.3	The HEI encourages its undergraduate students to form partnerships for	
	international publication in foreign languages with academics from intra-regional	
	universities through translation assistance, promotion, etc.	
3.4	The HEI encourages its undergraduate students to form partnerships for	
	international publication in foreign languages with academics from extra-regional	
	universities through translation assistance, promotion, etc.	
4	The global-local relationship is taken into account in the formulation of the HEI's	
	post-graduate curricula.	
4.1	Post-graduate curricula are designed/formulated in such a way as to encourage	
	intercultural collaboration (virtual or otherwise) between intra-regional universities.	
4.2	Post-graduate curricula are designed/formulated in such a way as to encourage	
	intercultural collaboration (virtual or otherwise) between extra-regional universities.	
4.3	The HEI encourages its post-graduate students to form partnerships for international	
	publication in foreign languages with academics from intra-regional universities	
	through translation assistance, promotion, etc.	
4.4	The HEI encourages its post-graduate students to form partnerships for international publication in foreign languages with academics from extra-regional universities	
	through translation assistance, promotion, etc.	
5	The HEI offers training activities to its faculty and staff for interactions with foreign	
3	academics.	
5.1	The HEI encourages its professors to form partnerships for international publication	
	in foreign languages with academics from intra-regional universities.	
5.2	The HEI encourages its professors to form partnerships for international publication	
	in foreign languages with academics from extra-regional universities.	
5.3	The HEI encourages its technical-administrative staff to form partnerships for	
	international publication in foreign languages with academics from intra-regional universities.	
5.4	The HEI encourages its technical-administrative staff to form partnerships for	
J. -	international publication in foreign languages with academics from extra-regional	
	universities.	
6	The HEI has a policy to encourage the revalidation/recognition of academic credits	
	obtained abroad to encourage its professors, students and technical-administrative	
	staff to seek academic specialization or other research, teaching and outreach	
	activities abroad.	
7	Local culture is considered and integrated into foreign cultural immersion activities	
	on campus/on campuses.	
8	Intercultural competence is taken into account in interactions with foreign	
	academics.	
_		

Source: The authors'.

Final Remarks

The remodeling of the matrix proposed by Amorim (2020) presented here may serve the purpose of addressing quality assurance in HEI in Latin America as the instrument carries sound assessment constructs like the ones outlined by Coombe, Folse and Hubley and described elsewhere in this paper. As Sawahel (2023) points out:

Internationalisation of higher education practices should strive to follow a levelling-up agenda that avoids an erosion of cultural values, human capital flight, and inequities from hegemonic relationships, while supporting innovation, equitable collaborations, and decolonization [...].

By providing comprehensive indicators which help the HEI foresee possible unintended effects of internationalisation, the matrix orients sustainable policies which, in turn, will hopefully translate into more situated and accountable practices. This, as Sawahel signals, fosters opportunities to adapt, to learn from mistakes and to (re)assess for more inclusive, equitable and diverse internationalisation policies.

References

- Altbach, P. & Sami, J. (2021). Why Latin America needs world-class universities.

 University World News, available at:

 https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20210301134018
 781, Accessed on February 23rd, 2023.
- Amorim, G. B. (2020). A internacionalização do ensino superior no Brasil: uma proposta de matriz multidimensional de (auto) avaliação. 145f. Tese (Doutorado em Linguística) Universidade Federal do Espírito Santo, Vitória, Espírito Santo.
- Amorim, G. B. & Finardi, K. R. (2017). Globalização e internacionalização do ensino superior: Evidências de um estudo de caso nos níveis micro, meso e macro. **Avaliação: Revista da Avaliação da Educação Superior**, Campinas/Sorocaba, vol. 3, n. 2, pp. 614-632.
- Amorim, G. B. & Finardi, K. R. (2021). Uma matriz de (auto)avaliação da internacionalização do ensino superior no Brasil. **Estudos Em Avaliação Educacional**, 31(78), 699–722. https://doi.org/10.18222/eae.v31i78.7381.
- Amorim, G. B. & Finardi, K. R. (2022). The Road(s) Not Taken and Internationalization in Brazil: Journey or Destination? **Acta Scientiarum Education (Online)**, Vol. 44, p.1-13.
- Chiappa, R. & Finardi, K. (2021). Coloniality Prints in Internationalization of Higher Education: The Case of Brazilian and Chilean International Scholarships. **Scholarship of Teaching and Learning in the South**, v.5, n.1, p.25-45. DOI: 10.36615/sotls.v5i1.161.
- Coombe, C. A.; Folse, K. S. & Hubley N. J. (2007). A practical guide to assessing English language learners. Ann Harbor, MI: University of Michigan Press.
- Echeverría-King, L. F., Chiappa, R., Leal, F., & Castiello-Gutiérrez, S. (2023). Análisis de políticas públicas de apoyo a la internacionalización de la educación superior en América Latina: un balance. **Revista de Educación Superior en América Latina.** Available at: https://rcientificas.uninorte.edu.co/index.php/esal/article/view/15472
- FAUBAI. (2016). Guide to English as Medium of Instruction in Brazilian Higher Education Institutions.
- FAUBAI. (2017). Orientações para a elaboração de políticas linguísticas para a internacionalização do ensino superior.
- FAUBAI. (2018). Guide to English as Medium of Instruction in Brazilian Higher Education Institutions 2018-2019.

- Finardi, K. R. (2022). As línguas e rankings no Oscar da internacionalização das produções científicas latino-americanas. **Estudos Linguísticos** (São Paulo, 1978), 51(1), p. 147-161.
- Finardi, K. R. (2021). Internacionalización desde una perspectiva del sur, crítica y emancipadora. Revista REDALINT. **Universidad, Internacionalización e Integración Regional**, 1(2), 95–117.
- Finardi, K., França, C. & Guimarães, F. (2023). Knowledge production and internationalization of Higher Education in the Global South: Latin America in focus. **Diálogos Latinoamericanos** 32(1), p. 1-19. https://doi.org/10.7146/dl.v32i1.127278.
- Finardi, K. R., França, C. & Guimarães, F. F. (2022). Ecology of knowledges and languages in Latin American academic production. **Ensaio: Avaliação e Políticas Públicas em Educação** [online]. 2022, v. 30, n. 116, https://doi.org/10.1590/S0104-40362022003003538.
- Finardi, K. R. & Guimarães, F. (2017). Internacionalização, rankings e publicações em inglês: a situação do Brasil na atualidade. **Estudos em Avaliação Educacional (Online**), v. 28, p. 600-626.
- Finardi, K. R. & Guimarães F. (2020). Internationalization and the Covid-19 Pandemic: Challenges and Opportunities for the Global South. **Journal of Education, Teaching and Social Studies**, v. 2, p. 1-15, 2020. DOI:10.22158/Jetss.V2n4p1
- Finardi, K. R., Macêdo Mendes, A. R., & Aparecido da Silva, K. (2022). Tensions and directions of internationalization in Brazil: Between competition and solidarity. **Education Policy Analysis Archives**, *30*, (58). https://doi.org/10.14507/epaa.30.6823
- Finardi, K., Moore, P. & Guimarães, F. (2021). 3 Glocalization and Internationalization in University Language Policy Making. In **Developing** and evaluating quality bilingual practices in higher education (pp. 54-72). Multilingual Matters.
- Guimarães, F. F., Finardi, K. R. & Amorim, G. B. (2021). From pandemic to paradigm shift: recalibrating Brazil's relationships with the Global North. **EAIE Forum Magazine**, 28–29.
- Guimarães, F. F. & Finardi, K. R. (2023). Pandemic and paradigm shift in internationalization: from competition, mobility and exclusivity to cooperation, virtuality and inclusion. In A. W. Wiseman, C. Matherly, & M. Crumley-Effinger (Eds.), Internationalization and imprints of the pandemic on higher education worldwide (1st ed., Vol. 44, Ser. International Perspectives on Education and Society, pp. 113–128). Emerald Publishing.
- Guimarães, F., Hildeblando Júnior, C. A. & Finardi, K. R. (2022). Formação de professores de línguas mediada por tecnologias digitais: Experiências de

- uma universidade no Sudeste do Brasil. **Linguagem & Ensino** (UCPel), v. 25, p. 179-204, 2022. https://doi.org/10.15210/10.15210/RLE.V25especial.4443
- Leal, F., Finardi, K. & Abba, J. (2022). Challenges for an internationalization of higher education from and for the global south. **Perspectives in Education**, *40*(3), 241-250.
- Lima, M. C. & Maranhão, C. M. S. de A. (2009). O sistema de educação superior mundial: entre a internacionalização ativa e passiva. **Avaliação: Revista da Avaliação da Educação Superior**, Campinas/Sorocaba, v. 14, n. 3, p.583-610.
- Olivares, C. (2023). Quality assurance must go beyond bureaucratic compliance. **University World News**, available at: https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20230127143305 95&utm_source=newsletter&utm_medium=email&utm_campaign=GLNL 0724, Access on February 27th, 2023.
- Ramos, M. Y. (2018). Internacionalização da pós-graduação no Brasil: lógica e mecanismos. **Educação e Pesquisa**, v. 44, p. 1-22.
- Sawahel, W. (2023). How to address unintended effects of internationalisation. **University World News**, available at:

 https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20230224091924
 215, Accessed on February 26th, 2023.
- Van den Akker, J. (1999). Principles and Methods of Development Research. In J.A., VAN DEN, R. BRANCH et al. (Eds.) **Design Approaches and Tools in Education and Training**. Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Publisher, p. 1-14.
- Vendemaine, A. & Kaiser, F. (2023). Developing ESD indicators, the missing links in rankings. **University World News**, available at: https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20230221143931 652, Accessed on February, 26th, 2023.