Engineering Mobility: An ethnographic study of how social media platforms are mediating transnational student mobility from India – Zoom chat function transcript, 11 June 2020

00:19:32 C Sanger: Good afternoon everybody

00:23:11 Cora Xu: Yes

00:26:15 Simon Marginson: Today we want to try something new - to keep the Chat open after the video stops (at 3 pm UK time) for another 30 minutes for Q&A with Sazana. So please send your questions, which can be considered during or after the 60 minutes of the video webinar.

00:34:27 Som Mishra: how can i join whatsapp group?

00:38:56 Vimal Subramanian: How are there FB & Whatsapp groups moderated? As a part of your research did you see any formalisation i.e Groups officially moderated by German Uni. Government representatives.

00:44:21 Cora Xu: It is striking that all this communication is in English. I wonder if some groups may use local languages? What is the role of the language of communication?

00:47:42 Claire Callender: Did you at any time assess the accuracy of the information provided via these social media sources? Some might argue that social media is a major source of misinformation.

00:49:12 Sylvie Lomer: (This is possibly a question of opinion rather than data) Do you think the role of these groups was more important since the destination of Germany may be a less familiar route for Indian students, so they are less likely to have personal connections with relevant experience? Would this be as important for students coming to the UK for example?

00:49:21 Kulshum Ansari: how can I join these groups

00:49:37 Katy Highet: Hi! Was the information predominantly practical information or did they provide guidance on 'behaviour' i.e. how to navigate new spaces? And if so, do you have any thoughts on how this may link to how migration, and even these pre-migration spaces of social media support, are tied to performances of or aspiration to middle-classness?

00:51:15 Sylvie Lomer: *Comment* I think this data usefully also demonstrates students' agency in fostering the connections and facilitating future study abroad. Very interesting and rich data!

00:51:20 Cleo Fatoorehchi: Thanks for a great presentation! How did they hear about the groups in the first place? Were they suggested by the university or embassy, or someone else?

00:51:31 Miguel Antonio Lim: Many thanks Sazana, Could you comment on the potential role of gender in your findings. A lot of respondents seem to be male. And several of your quotes show them using 'bro' language. Is this a common finding? (Also to link this to anedoctal experience at study abroad fairs where Germany is seen as a 'masculine' destination for graduate studies in engineering and science - do you think this plays a role in your findings)

00:51:57 Doria Abdullah: thanks Miguel, that's a question on my mind too

00:52:31 Cassie.M Zhang: Thanks for the brilliant presentation so far! With regards to the "Available on internet but more easily accessible through groups". I have three questions 1) Is the 'MS in Germany' biggest community on studying abroad? Who are leading the direction in those groups? 2) Is it just an interest group (for now) or it is actually can be called as an (professional) association? 3)what are the marketing channels are there apart from FB and WhatsApp? I also would like to know more about the ''fee]Thank you!

00:53:07 Simon Marginson: Q&A order begins with Vimal Subramanian, Claire Callender, Cora Xu

00:53:20 Doria Abdullah: perhaps we can extend Miguel's question by talking about variation in the caste system as well? (sorry for the term "caste system", can't seem to find a better term)

00:53:31 SY Koh: Once you have answered the question relating to your talk, could you share your findings about the new education consultancy services that emerged through these social media platforms? And how does this sit in relation to the anti-consultant narrative you mentioned in the conclusion?

00:53:55 Yi'En Cheng: Same request as SY Koh. :)

00:54:16 Cassie.M Zhang: I'd like to know more about the 'fee structure' of education consultants, albeit this question might be out of the scope of your research.

00:56:10 James Robson: Fascinating data. Identity is a key part of CoP theory. To what extent do you feel engagement in these groups shapes users' identity and more broadly act as a mechanism of self-formation?

00:56:12 John Anchor: Are there any features of India and its students which make these processes particularly important or prominent?

00:56:32 Cora Xu: Big applauses Sazana!

00:56:44 Cora Xu: Such a great presentation

00:56:56 Doria Abdullah: Thanks Sazana, great presentation

00:57:21 Cassie.M Zhang: Yes, big applauses! Thank you Sazana!

00:57:52 Cora Xu: I would like to follow up with Miguel's question about gender, to ask if you could discuss a bit about the IELTS bride phenomenon--do you think these social media groups make contribute to lessening the stress/pressure on IELTS brides?

00:58:03 Anurag Shukla: Thanks, Sazana. Whether and how the existing social networks (based on the social/linguistic/geographical identities) mediated the participation in these communities of practice? And how often these identities were deployed? Could you also see the formation of hierarchies while members interacted with each other in the group?

01:01:24 Trif Victorița: Perhaps it is about a population target addicted to internet. Might be about adverse effects on data?

01:04:11 Simon Marginson: next questions from in order Sylvie Lomer, Miguel Lim, Katy Highet

01:05:02 Yi: is there any cultural influence on their communication pattern? i

01:05:10 Doria Abdullah: *comment* interesting, in-community norms regulate how the WhatsApp groups function

01:05:50 Clare Walsh: Thanks Sazana for sharing your research. Great presentation.

01:08:13 Sylvie Lomer: I think the democratising potential for these groups to help break down social capital barriers is very interesting.

01:09:21 Jihyun Lee: What about the issue of a digital divide? It seems that people use this platform already have an access to this technology and internet in the first place. In this context, can you really say that social media "democratise" the access to international education?

01:09:25 vandana singh: Thank you so much for an interesting presentation. I would like to know, what is the role of knowing German before applying for the German Universities. As far as I remember there were not many institutions in India which teach the language.

01:10:20 Simon Marginson: Next questions from Katy Highet, Cleo Fatoorehchi, Doria Abdullah, James Robson

01:11:18 Vimal Subramanian: Well done Sazana. Thank you!

Very insightful real world example of how self-organised communities of practice could serve common good.

Good luck with your future endeavours.

01:14:02 Cora Xu: Well done Sazana. I have to leave now but let's catch up soon!

01:14:30 Anurag Shukla: Thanks Sazara, for such an insightful presentation. I gotta go to attend another meeting. Best of luck with your future endeavours.

01:15:40 sreedharan menon: Great Presentation - From Mumbai

01:15:49 Neil Carey: Completely stimulating and inspiring presentation - thank you! Love the way that this 'case study' raises so many more 'macro'-level issues around mobilities . . . must go now.

01:16:06 Olga Mun: Thank you so much for a great presentation, Sazana!

01:18:02 Sylvie Lomer: Thank you very much!

01:18:44 Cristina Carvalho: Thank you so much, Sazana! Great presentation! - from Brazil.

01:18:59 Yusuf Ikbal Oldaç: Great presentation. Thank you, Sazana!

01:19:18 Simon Marginson: Last question in the video Webinar is from James Robson. Then we go into the written Q&A in the Chat

01:19:34 Amardeep Kumar: Thank you Sazana and Simon!

01:20:31 Mohd Mohsin Qureshi: Thank you so much, Sazana for the Great and Informative presentation - Mohd Mohsin from India

01:20:53 Trif Victorița: Thank you!

01:23:51 Kulshum Ansari: thank you sazana mam for great presentation

01:23:52 Xin Xu: Excellent presentation! Thank you!

01:24:01 Jihyun Lee: Thank you Sazana for your great presentation!

01:24:16 Arvind Vepa: Thank you.

01:24:17 Linh Nguyen: Thank you Simon and Sazana for a great webinar, and for everyone for the great discussion. :)

01:24:39 Angela P: Thank you!✿

01:24:45 Cassie.M Zhang: Thank you so much Sazana and Simon!

01:25:19 Giulio Marini: Hi, does the % of males reflect those studying in India?

01:25:36 Simon Marginson: Great presentation and discussion Sazana. We're all now watching your work with interest!

01:27:19 Sazana Jayadeva: Thanks so much to everyone who attended!

01:27:36 Sazana Jayadeva: Just read all the questions I missed when I was speaking

01:27:43 Sazana Jayadeva: If anyone is still here, happy to chat!

01:27:49 SY Koh: Hi Sazana, I had a question about the new education consultancy services that emerged through these social media platforms. Could you share some of your findings,

and your thoughts on how these services sit in relation to the anti-consultant narrative you mentioned in the conclusion?

01:28:35 Sazana Jayadeva: Hi, thanks for the question!

01:29:00 Sazana Jayadeva: I'll try to boil it down to a few main points :)

01:29:45 Simon Marginson: We'll keep Chat running till 3.30 pm UK time

01:31:47 Sazana Jayadeva: So, first of all, a small number of the group member -- through participation in the groups --had become very interested in becoming consultants, and monetising their study abroad expertise. However, they strongly distanced themselves from education consultants in India. They said that while the education consultants were businesses, they were friendly peers. They also challenged the expertise of education consultants and said that given their first-hand experience of the application process, they were more suitable experts

01:32:02 Sazana Jayadeva: The norms of the group also strongly regulated how they could operate

01:32:33 Sazana Jayadeva: They couldn't directly advertise their services and recruit clients from the groups, but had to perform as active group members and get recognised in this way.

01:33:14 Sazana Jayadeva: Furthermore, the YouTubers that I spoke about briefly had become education influencers of sorts, and were also strongly anti-consultant.

01:37:23 SY Koh: I see. So the services are quite specific to the application process? Were group members willing to pay for their services?

01:37:47 Yi'En Cheng: "had become very interested in becoming consultants, and monetising their study abroad expertise. However, they strongly distanced themselves from education consultants in India." -> this is so interesting, Sazana. The potential for these people to become entrepreneurs. Reminds me of the Indian youths in C Jeffrey's Time Pass.

01:38:47 Yi'En Cheng: Got to go. Great presentation and looking forward to hearing more about your research in the future. :)

01:39:09 Sazana Jayadeva: To SY Koh: Yes, some groups members were happy to pay for more support and for the "insider knowledge". Some were really busy with multiple other commitments and had limited time to invest in the application process.

01:39:23 Sazana Jayadeva: Thanks so much, Yi'En, so glad you could come!

01:39:38 Sazana Jayadeva: Yes, look forward to discussing more of this consultant-focused research with you!

01:41:16 SY Koh: Thanks! This is really interesting. Hope we can discuss more about the changing education migration infrastructure!

01:41:43 Sazana Jayadeva: Yes, that would be great! Do get in touch.

01:42:09 SY Koh: Thanks for the insightful presentation! I've gotta go now.

01:42:15 Sazana Jayadeva: Thank you!

01:42:27 Cassie.M Zhang: Thanks Sazana! Just wanna to mention sth similar in China at the last few minites. These groups remind me similar groups in China. In China, the use of education consultants are prevalent. Some of them are large size, chain businesses; Some of them are actually online-only 'boutique' education consultancy which started from sth similar to 'these groups' in this research. Would you think these groups many be converting into the online 'education consultant business'?

01:43:02 Cassie.M Zhang: Thanks, it was brilliant presentation!

01:43:23 Cassie.M Zhang: *may be

01:44:08 Sazana Jayadeva: Hmm, I don't think the groups will develop into education consultancies, although some group members might indeed start education consultancies of their own.

01:44:42 Sazana Jayadeva: I'd be very curious to hear more about these 'boutique' consultants that developed from online groups, Cassie! Sounds very interesting indeed.

01:45:27 Lucian Lee: Hello Sazana thank you for that wonderful presentation. You talked a little about "updated" information group members shared to ascertain the accuracy of the knowledge being shared in these groups. I was wondering if you saw any of these groups utilise like a crowdsourced resource document/package (e.g. a Google Docs) to centralise the collective knowledge that members of the group can access and perhaps even edit accordingly? Or was the information/knowledge exchange primarily done through personal messages/chats?

01:46:35 Sazana Jayadeva: Great question, Lucian!

01:46:41 Sazana Jayadeva: Yes, some groups used google docs

01:47:11 Sazana Jayadeva: ...and google spreadsheets

01:47:13 Cassie.M Zhang: Let's catch up when !

01:47:27 Linh Nguyen: Thank you again Sazana for your insightful presentation, I really appreciate the subtlety that you've discussed. All the best to you and your work!

01:47:57 Cassie.M Zhang: it's safe. Keep pressing ''enter'' accidentally. Sorry…

01:48:17 Sazana Jayadeva: But a lot of the information did get shared within the groups. The active group members served as the "memory" of the groups and would be quick to direct people to where to find what!

01:48:37 Sazana Jayadeva: Thanks Linh! So glad you liked it.

01:48:46 Lucian Lee: Thanks a lot Sazana that's really insightful.

01:49:11 Cassie.M Zhang: Thank you Sazana and Simon!

01:49:41 Sazana Jayadeva: Thank you for the great questions, everyone!!

01:51:17 CGHE Webinars: Hi everyone, going to close the webinar fully now. Many thanks to Sazana and everyone for their participation this afternoon!

01:51:29 Sazana Jayadeva: Thank you! And see you next week!